

Equation (15) of Grossman, Nir, and Perez [PRL 103, 071602 (2009)] is

$$\left(1 - \left|\frac{q}{p}\right|^4\right)^2 \left[\frac{1 + \left(\frac{y}{x}\right)^4 \tan^2 \phi}{\sin^2 \phi}\right] = 16 \left(\frac{y}{x}\right)^2 \left|\frac{q}{p}\right|^4 + \left[1 + \left(\frac{y}{x}\right)^2\right]^2 \left(1 - \left|\frac{q}{p}\right|^4\right)^2.$$

Defining  $z \equiv |q/p|^4$  and  $r \equiv (y/x)^2$  gives

$$(1 - z)^2 \left(\frac{1 + r^2 \tan^2 \phi}{\sin^2 \phi}\right) = 16rz + (1 + r)^2 (1 - z)^2 \quad (1)$$

$$(1 - z)^2 \left[\frac{1 + r^2 \tan^2 \phi}{\sin^2 \phi} - (1 + r)^2\right] = 16rz.$$

This can be written in the standard quadratic form  $\alpha z^2 + \beta z + \gamma = 0$ , where

$$\alpha = \left[\frac{1 + r^2 \tan^2 \phi}{\sin^2 \phi} - (1 + r)^2\right]$$

$$\beta = -16r - 2\alpha$$

$$\gamma = \alpha.$$

Thus  $z = (-\beta \pm \sqrt{\beta^2 - 4\alpha\gamma})/2\alpha$ , and  $|q/p| = z^{1/4}$ . Note that there is a two-fold ambiguity in  $z$  arising from the quadratic equation. We find that usually the solution with the positive sign is the correct one, but not always.

From Eq. (1) we obtain

$$\frac{(1 - z)^2}{16rz + (1 + r)^2(1 - z)^2} = \frac{\sin^2 \phi}{1 + r^2 \tan^2 \phi}.$$

Defining the left-hand side as  $\xi$  gives

$$\begin{aligned} \xi + \xi r^2 \tan^2 \phi &= \sin^2 \phi \\ \xi \cos^2 \phi + \xi r^2 \sin^2 \phi &= \sin^2 \phi \cos^2 \phi \\ \xi - \xi \sin^2 \phi + \xi r^2 \sin^2 \phi &= \sin^2 \phi - \sin^4 \phi. \end{aligned}$$

Defining  $u \equiv \sin^2 \phi$ , we can write this in the quadratic form  $\alpha u^2 + \beta u + \gamma = 0$ , where

$$\alpha = 1$$

$$\beta = \xi r^2 - \xi - 1$$

$$\gamma = \xi.$$

Thus  $u = (-\beta - \sqrt{\beta^2 - 4\alpha\gamma})/2\alpha$ , and  $\phi = \sin^{-1}(\pm\sqrt{u})$ . Note that there is a sign ambiguity in  $\phi$  that cannot be resolved by this method. In principle there is a two-fold ambiguity in  $u$  arising from the quadratic equation; however, we find that the solution with the negative sign is always the correct one.